



ORGANIC TOLERANCE AND HARMONY IN THE PESANTREN BALI BINA INSANI

Muhammad Fahmi¹, Masdar Hilmy², Senata Adi Prasetya³

UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya

Email: ¹muhammadfahmi@uinsby.ac.id, ²masdar.hilmy@uinsby.ac.id,
³smart08senata@gmail.com

Abstract: This paper describes the organic tolerance, capital, and management of harmony at a pesantren of the Muslim minority in Bali, Indonesia. The pesantren is Bali Bina Insani (BBI) in which there are Muslim and Hindu teachers. The organic tolerance, capital, and management of harmony with the accommodation of some Hindu teachers is a certainty. Data collection was carried out through documentation, participant observation, and in-depth interviews, then qualitatively analyzed. The results showed that the capital of the *pesantren* in harmonizing Muslim and Hindu teachers is tolerant (*tasāmuḥ*) and inclusive. Aligned with the pesantren's vision and mission is realizing Islam *rahmah li al-'ālamīn* in all community services and making friends with all people regardless of ethnic, racial, cultural, and religious diversity. In this context, organic tolerance which was developed by *pesantren* is a certainty. Also, the management of harmony has been implemented professionally. The *pesantren* does not emphasize religious symbols, but it concerns the essence of Islamic orthodoxy. The *pesantren* management never questioned the differences of ethnic, racial, cultural, and religious of some teachers. For them, the most important thing is doing their jobs very well and professionally according to their authority. So, the harmony in this pesantren is organic.

Keywords: organic tolerance, harmony, pesantren, and Muslim minority.

DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.20414/ujis.v26i2.567>

Introduction

INDONESIA is a plural nation, consisting of various tribes, groups, religions, and others.¹ Diversity can create friction,² that have the

¹ Ahmad Maskur, "Masalah Kebangsaan Halaman 1-Kompasiana.Com," accessed October 17, 2022, <https://www.kompasiana.com/ahmadmaskur2/5529b61ff17e612416d624a5/masalah-kebangsaan>.

potential to create conflict.³ Conflict can occur when there is an intersection between religion and political and economic interests.⁴ When there is conflict, efforts toward equality in the social strata are increasingly difficult to realize.⁵ The intersection between aspects that can trigger conflicts between groups in these various fields,⁶ eventually gives rise to a sense of desire to defeat each other and get rid of each other.⁷ If this is let to happen, a peaceful, secure, and conducive life will become more difficult to realize.

On the other hand, conflict can be triggered by the nation's inability to internalize unity in diversity. Conflicts can also be triggered due to the presence of a majority group that does not accept the development of a minority group. Whereas, several minority groups assimilated and continued to grow.⁸ The phenomenon of conflict is a major sociocultural problem, which is not only actual but also historical. In the current era of reform, ethnic, social, class, racial, and religious conflicts have a profound

² Kuntowijoyo, *Paradigma Islam: Interpretasi Untuk Aksi*, edited by A.E Priyono (Bandung: Mizan Publika, 2008).

³ Syafa'atun Almirzana, "Pluralisme, Konflik, Dan Dialog: Analisa Dan Refleksi," *Jurnal Esensia* 2, No. 1 (2001).

⁴ Komarudin Hidayat, "Agama-Agama Besar Dunia: Masalah Perkembangan Dan Interelasi" Dalam Komarudin Hidayat Dan Ahmad Gaus AF, " *Passing Over Melintasi Batas Agama* (Jakarta: Gramedia, 1998); Alwi Shihab, *Islam Inklusif: Menuju Sikap Terbuka Dalam Beragama* (Diterbitkan atas kerja sama AN Teve dan Penerbit Mizan, 1997); Asghar Ali Engineer, "On Religious and Intercultural Dialogue," [Http://www. Global.Net.Com](http://www.Global.Net.Com), 2000; Hasan Hanafi, *Islam in The Modern World: Tradition, Revolution and Culture* Vol. II (Kairo: Dar Keaba Bookshop, 2000).

⁵ Manstead, Antony SR. "The psychology of social class: How socioeconomic status impacts thought, feelings, and behavior." *British Journal of Social Psychology* 57.2 (2018): 267-291.

⁶ Fahmi Salatalohy and Rio Pelu, eds. *Nasionalisme kaum pinggir: dari Maluku tentang Maluku untuk Indonesia* (Yogyakarta: LKiS Pelangi Aksara, 2004); Ngainun Naim, *Pendidikan multikultural, konsep dan aplikasi* (Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media, 2017).

⁷ K. J. Veegar, *Realitas Sosial: refleksi filsafat sosial atas hubungan individu-masyarakat dalam cakrawala sejarah sosiologi* (Jakarta: Gramedia, 1986); Ali Maksum, *Pluralisme dan multikulturalisme: paradigma baru pendidikan agama Islam di Indonesia* (Malang: Aditya Media Publication, 2011).

⁸ Beverly Crawford, and Ronnie D. Lipschutz. "The myth of" ethnic conflict": politics, economics, and" cultural" violence." *Research Series* (1998).

impact on the economic and welfare issues of the people and are closely related to socio-cultural change.⁹

In line with the description above, the multicultural concept emphasizes inclusivity and respect for diverse entities including cultural aspects.¹⁰ Accordingly, multicultural awareness will lead to the attitude of mutual tolerance, solidarity, inclusivity, respect, and appreciation of every entity of diversity. In this regard, in Tabanan, Bali, Indonesia, there is a Pesantren Bali Bina Insani (BBI), which has educational paradigms and practices that value multiculturalism and pluralism. Plural and multicultural situations and conditions necessitate the formation of an inclusive, multicultural model of religious education,¹¹ as happened in the Pesantren BBI. Interestingly, different from many other *pesantrens* who are generally fanatical and set a firm barrier to other religious communities, Pesantren BBI opens up and receives some teachers of a different religion to teach at its educational institution.

There are several Hindu educators (teachers) who actively participate in teaching-learning activities in educational institutions of the *pesantren*. They (Muslim and Hindu teachers) can live harmoniously and peacefully in the institutions and equally share their knowledge with the Muslim *santri*. The *pesantren* deliberately recruited Hindu teachers to help teach at its institutions.¹² The reality is interesting to be discussed more deeply, especially about the paradigm and management practices of Pesantren BBI where Hindu teachers can coexist peacefully with Muslims while sharing their knowledge with Muslim students.

⁹ Akhiruddin Mahjuddin, *Dampak Konflik terhadap Perkembangan Ekonomi dan Tingkat Kesejahteraan Rakyat* (Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia, 2012).

¹⁰ Abd Chayyi Fanani, "Studi tentang Metode Belajar Mahasiswa Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Upaya Pengembangan Diri di Fakultas Tarbiyah IAIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya Periode 2000-2002." *Jurnal Fakultas Tarbiyah UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya* (2003).

¹¹ Achmad Asrori, "Contemporary religious education model on the challenge of Indonesian multiculturalism." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 10.2 (2016): 261-284.

¹² "Profile Pesantren Bali Bina Insani," *Pesantren Bali Bina Insani*, accessed September 23, 2020, <https://pesantrenbali.com/profil-pondok-pesantren-bali-bina-insani-yayasan-la-royba/>.

The main question that needs to be explained in this study is what is the capital of harmony of people of different religions in Pesantren BBI and how is harmony managed in it? This question is attributed to the practice of organic tolerance that occurs in the *pesantren*. To answer this question, descriptive-qualitative research is carried out to describe the phenomenon and reality of harmony contextually from a natural setting by utilizing the researcher as a key instrument. In analyzing the data, this article employs a phenomenological approach using documentation, participant observation, and in-depth interviews with key informants of the Pesantren BBI.

BBI as a *Pesantren* in Muslim-Minority Community

Pesantren Bali Bina Insani (thereafter abbreviated as BBI) was first established on October 27, 1991.¹³ This *pesantren* was pioneered by H. Ketut Imaduddin Jamal. The establishment of this *pesantren* was inspired by an empirical fact that shows the lack of Islamic education institutions in Bali, especially *pesantrens*. Muslims in Bali numbers only about 6.17% of the population, and there is no representative *pesantren* there in general.¹⁴

Pesantren BBI stands on an area of 5700 m² and is in the midst of a devout Hindu society. The existence of the *pesantren* has been well accepted by the local community because of several factors, including the historical factor, one of which is that the *pesantren* has never engendered ethnic and religious conflicts, in addition to its shared values of tolerance (*tasāmuḥ*), togetherness and equality (*musawah*). The majority of its *santri* come from the Province of Bali, and some are from other regions, such as Sumatra, Java, Lombok, Nusa Tenggara, and East Timor (the former name of Timor Leste –before separated from the Republic of Indonesia).¹⁵

The interesting thing in educational institutions of Pesantren BBI is the existence of some Hindu teachers who were deliberately recruited to teach at formal schools. There are all 9 Hindu teachers.

¹³ Interview with KH. Ketut Imamuddin Djamal (The Founder and Leader of the Pesantren BBI) on September 25, 2018.

¹⁴ Profile Pesantren Bali Bina Insani, 2018.

¹⁵ Interview with Yuli Saiful Bahri (principal of MTs. BBI) on October 24, 2018.

They are asked to teach Civics, Social Studies, Art, Balinese Dance, and other general subjects.¹⁶ Hindu female teachers are also left with their hair open (not covered by a veil, headscarf, or *hijab*). In addition, their clothes are not tightly closed (open her hair); they are just plain shirts and trousers.¹⁷ The reason behind this "permission" policy is to keep off the impression of Islamization efforts towards them.¹⁸

The values of Pesantren BBI include (1) Islam (Islamic creeds (*aqīdah*), Islamic jurisprudence (*sharī'ah*), and Islamic ethics (*akhlāq*); scientific and full-of-wisdom traditions developed among Muslims, especially of the golden age of Islam); (2) Indonesianness (Pancasila and the Indonesia 1945-Constitution, Act No. 20 of 2003 on National Education System, other related activities); (3) *pesantrenity* (Panca Jiwa pesantren: sincerity, simplicity, *ukhrawah Islāmiyyah* [brotherhood among Muslims], independency, and positive freedom), *sunnah* and positive traditions of *pesantren*, philosophy of "learning for worship" (*al-'Ilm al-nafi'* (useful knowledge) and *al-hikmah* (wisdom)); (4) struggles (the philosophy of "*al-jihad*, *al-mujahadah*, and *al-ijtihad*", the philosophy of "achieving the most outstanding achievement, best Service, unconditional sacrifice"), the struggle towards "*'izz al-Islām wa al-muslimīn*" as "*rahmah li al-'ālamīn*", a set of "sincerity, loyalty, integrity, devotion".¹⁹

The education method is chosen and conducted by maintaining good old ones and accommodating better new ones (*al-muhāfazah 'alā al-qadīmi al-ṣāliḥ wa al-akhdu bi al-jadīd al-aṣlah*). This is based on effectiveness, efficiency, and acceleration. The method of education is oriented towards the achievement of the goal of education: transformation in the form of personality

¹⁶ Interview with Purnomo (Vice Principal of MTs. BBI) on August 26, 2018.

¹⁷ Observation on August 26, 2018.

¹⁸ M. Hamdan Basyar, *Minoritas Muslim Bali: Di Gianyar dan Tabanan*. Vol. 2 (Jakarta: Kerjasama Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia dan Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional RI, 2009).

¹⁹ Profile Pesantren Bali Bina Insani, 2018.

development.²⁰ Hence, the education methods are emphasized exemplary, habituation, milieu formation, advice and direction, assignment, and supervision.

Organic Tolerance in the Pesantren BBI

Muslim minority citizens in Balinese societies want to freely express and practice their religiosity, try to establish suitable institutions for educational and religious activities, and seek to politically promote their interests. These goals and the related demands receive mixed reactions from the general public.²¹ Intolerance of Muslim practices is generally explained by how people feel about Muslims as a group, with research showing that people who reject Muslim practices tend to have anti-Muslim sentiments.²² For example, Blinder, Ford, and Ivarsflaten found that Muslim prejudice is an important driver for opposing Muslim religious school accommodation in Sweden, Norway, and the United Kingdom. Similarly, research shows that anti-Muslim sentiment underpins support for a ban on headscarves, Islamic education, and mosque building.²³

Yet, tolerance in certain Muslim practices does not always go hand in hand with people's feelings towards Muslims.²⁴ For

²⁰ Linda Darling-Hammond, et al. "Implications for the educational practice of the science of learning and development." *Applied developmental science* 24.2 (2020): 97-140.

²¹ M. Dangubić, Maykel Verkuyten, and Tobias H. Stark. "Understanding (in) tolerance of Muslim minority practices: A latent profile analysis." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 47.7 (2021): 1517-1538; Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad, and Jane I. Smith, eds. *Muslim minorities in the West: Visible and invisible*. Rowman Altamira, 2002; Helbling, Marc. "Islamophobia in the West: An introduction." *Islamophobia in the West* (Routledge, 2013), 15-32.

²² Vassilis Saroglou, et al. "Host society's dislike of the Islamic veil: The role of subtle prejudice, values, and religion." *International journal of intercultural relations* 33.5 (2009): 419-428.

²³ Jolanda Van der Noll, "Religious toleration of Muslims in the German public sphere." *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 38 (2014): 60-74; M. Dangubić, Maykel Verkuyten, and Tobias H. Stark. "Understanding (in) tolerance of Muslim minority practices: A latent profile analysis." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 47.7 (2021): 1517-1538.

²⁴ Levi Adelman, and Maykel Verkuyten. "Prejudice and the acceptance of Muslim minority practices: A person-centered approach." *Social Psychology* 51.1

example, among a national sample in four Western European countries, most people with positive feelings toward Muslims supported the ban on the hijab,²⁵ and also objected to Islamic education in German public schools and the construction of mosques.²⁶ In addition, some individuals who had negative feelings toward Muslims were willing to support the appointment of a Muslim teacher,²⁷ the wearing of the hijab, Islamic education, and the construction of mosques.²⁸

The same thing has also been experienced by the Balinese Muslim community which is a minority Muslim in Bali, especially since the Bali bombings 1 and 2 which tarnished the image of Islam as a peaceful religion. Relations between Muslims and Hindus in Bali initially harmonious turned tense and suspicious of each other.²⁹ In fact, this has an impact on the Prohibition of Muslim activities in public spaces, including educational and religious institutions. However, over time, relations between Muslims and Hindus became harmonious again. One of the reasons is the role of Islamic and Hindu religious leaders to sit back and straighten out the root of the problems that occur. This is also inseparable from the characteristics of Muslims and also tolerant Balinese Hindus.³⁰

(2020): 1-16; Van der Noll, "Religious toleration of Muslims in the German public sphere", 60-74; Paul M. Sniderman, and Louk Hagendoorn. "When ways of life collide." *When Ways of Life Collide* (Princeton University Press, 2009).

²⁵ Marc Helbling, "Opposing Muslims and the Muslim headscarf in Western Europe." *European sociological review* 30.2 (2014): 242-257.

²⁶ Van der Noll, "Religious toleration of Muslims in the German public sphere", 60-74.

²⁷ Jolanda van der Noll, Edwin Poppe, and Maykel Verkuyten. "Political tolerance and prejudice: Differential reactions toward Muslims in the Netherlands." *Basic and Applied Social Psychology* 32.1 (2010): 46-56.

²⁸ Dangubić, "Understanding (in) tolerance of Muslim minority practices: A latent profile analysis", 1517-1538.

²⁹ Dhururudin Mashad, *Muslim Bali: mencari kembali harmoni yang hilang* (Jakarta: Pustaka Al Kautsar, 2014).

³⁰ Muhammad Fahmi, M. Ridlwan Nasir, and Masdar Hilmy, "Islamic education in a minority setting: the translation of multicultural education at a local pesantren in Bali, Indonesia." *Episteme: Jurnal Pengembangan Ilmu Keislaman* 15.2 (2020): 345-364.

This kind of tolerant (organic) attitude is a key term in the findings of the multicultural education concept in this study. The tolerant attitude in the BBI Pesantren begins from a perspective that can accept the diversity and differences that exist. At the macro level, there are two models of tolerance that Muslims can do; organic tolerance or active and passive. Active tolerance is a living tolerance (organic), which more or less can be seen from the behavior of Abdurrahman Wahid (Gus Dur); including also carried out by the BBI Pesantren. This model of tolerance leads to the meaning of not only accepting differences in beliefs or religious beliefs of other religions but also contributing to protecting them. While passive tolerance is the attitude and behavior of accepting the diversity and differences of other people's ideologies without any treatment to followers of other religions or ideologies.

In Pesantren BBI, the concept of multicultural education is based on tolerance and organic tolerance.³¹ Multicultural education that bears the fruit of organic tolerance in BBI boarding schools is an inevitable practical reality and is present because of rational choices as a strategy for adapting boarding schools in Muslim minority areas. Based on the influence of individual *kiai*, the norms formed in the BBI Pesantren are in the form of fundamental values of pesantren and awareness to accept and choose the norm as a choice of action. The power of the norm that the individual exhibits, and then becomes the reality of the norm, can become a boundary of space that prevents others from undermining the basic character that has developed massively.

In this context, mutual respect for diversity can be established through multicultural education. This educational Model was chosen by the BBI Pesantren as a solution to maximize the understanding of tolerant values in the education system because this educational strategy adopts values found in different cultures and seeks to enforce tolerance by instilling it into students, teachers, and their communities. Multicultural education rejects all

³¹ Observation on August 26, 2018.

forms of discrimination in schools and society by promoting the principles of democracy and social justice.³²

Furthermore, the presence of non-Muslim teachers and employees in formal schools (Madrasah Tsanawiyah and Madrasah Aliyah) under the auspices of the BBI pesantren is an important marker that this boarding school is indeed multicultural. BBI Islamic boarding school also prioritizes tolerant and non-discriminatory attitudes toward anyone even with different ideological backgrounds and groups.³³ The tolerant inscription was even officially installed in the Hall of this boarding school.

In terms of teacher recruitment, BBI Pesantren is open to receiving educators in certain subjects and is also open to non-Muslim education personnel. There is room for adherents of various religious beliefs in Islam to become educators and education in BBI boarding schools because, in the system of receiving educators, there is no trace of the background of religious understanding.³⁴

The BBI Pesantren has an orientation to always appreciate differences and prioritize similarities. As stated by KH. Ketut Imaduddin Djamal, that the orientation of multicultural education in BBI Pesantren is the desire to appreciate differences and promote equality. He wants all students here to have a tolerant attitude and be able to maintain brotherhood among others. Moreover, they are in minority situations and conditions. For a minority to be recognized as a majority group with different beliefs and ideologies, the minority must respect the majority group. One of them is by accommodating them to be part of the

³² Wendy Amosa, and Paul C. Gorski, "Directions and misdirections in multicultural education: An analysis of session offerings at the annual conference of the National Association for Multicultural Education." *Multicultural Perspectives* 10.3 (2008): 167-174; Jennifer Brady, "An Interview With Paul Gorski, Creator Of The Multicultural Pavilion", in laulima.hawaii.edu, accessed 7th August 2022.

³³ Interview with Purnomo on August 26, 2018.

³⁴ Muhammad Fahmi, *Pendidikan multikultural sebagai strategi adaptasi Pesantren Bali Bina Insani di daerah minoritas muslim Tabanan Bali* (Dis. UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2019), 246-247.

pesantren, namely recruiting them to be teachers and employees, because the institution needs it.³⁵

The Capital of Harmony

The paradigm and framework of thinking of Pesantren BBI is a tolerant attitude (*tasāmuḥ*). This is the major capital of the *pesantren*. This capital then makes this *pesantren* recruit Hindu teachers to teach some general subjects in this *pesantren's* schools. About how pesantren features tolerance, Bahri said:

"Pesantren must realize pluralism over diversity with the concept of *tasāmuḥ*. Multiculturalism should be introduced. Religious tolerance must be realized, one of which is mutual respect. Harmony of religious people is very important to be realized in the form of cooperation, joint business, social interaction, community service, visiting the sick/dead, raising cattle, and so forth. These things are already practiced in the pesantren".³⁶

In order to realize pluralism and a tolerant Islamic education, the Pesantren BBI organizes a tolerant theology of education. In the study of Bambang Qomaruzzaman and B. Busro, there are three aspects of tolerant Islamic education theology, namely (1) educational activities are the essence of Islamic theology,³⁷ there is no faith without understanding and no understanding without education; (2) education oriented to encourage individuals to gain religious experiences that contain a commitment to participate in realizing justice and social achievement, and (3) religious experience resulting from education is transformed to create a tolerant attitude.

The existence of non-Muslim (Hindu) teachers at the Pesantren BBI is evidence of the implementation of the theological aspects of tolerant Islamic education and also as an adaptation strategy for Islamic boarding schools in the midst of Hindu society.³⁸ The accommodative practices of Hindu teachers and the geographical conditions of the Pesantren BBI in the middle of

³⁵ Interview with Djamal, on August 25, 2018.

³⁶ Interview with Bahri, on August 25, 2018.

³⁷ Bambang Qomaruzzaman, and B. Busro. "Tolerance Islam theology of education hermeneutic reading of Tariq Ramadan thought." *QIJS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)* 7.2 (2019): 203-238.

³⁸ Observation on August 26, 2018.

Balinese society which are predominantly Hindu, remind the author of the existence of Muslim minorities in a secular country where they live in a multicultural society that can enjoy the freedom of diversity. Existing tolerant practices are stronger than the tension and inter-religious conflicts that have occurred.³⁹ This phenomenon and reality are intertwined with aspects of tolerance, pluralism, and multicultural education organized by this Pesantren BBI.

The above tolerant and inclusive framework of thought becomes the basis for the attitudes and acts of Pesantren BBI so that they can live in harmony with people of different religions in the same institution. The existence of Hindu teachers in the *pesantren* institution is deliberately introduced as a form of Muslim (*pesantren*) concern to other surrounding religious communities, the *pesantren* requires their skills. This considered attitude is at least driven by two factors: *ukhuwah* and political. *Ukhuwah* (sense of brotherhood) is needed to create peace and respect in every human interaction. In Islam, the brotherhood consists of *ukhuwah Islāmiyyah* (Islamic or among-Muslim brotherhood), *ukhuwah waṭāniyyah* (nation and homeland brotherhood), and *ukhuwah bashariyyah* (brotherhood of humanity). The practice of *ukhuwah* between Muslims and Hindus at Pesantren BBI means applying the *ukhuwah waṭāniyyah* and *bashariyyah*.

The *pesantren's* purpose of recruiting Hindu teachers among others is to realize pluralism. Pluralism here does not mean to consider all religions as true but to believe that each religion is true for its respective adherents. Thus, pluralism leads to the attitude of religious tolerance. Due to the tolerant and inclusive attitude of the *pesantren*, the relationship between Muslim and Hindu teachers is well-tied and productive. Hindu teachers are very concerned with educating *santri* at the *pesantren*, while the *santri* is also very

³⁹ Perez Zagorin, "How the idea of religious toleration came to the West." *How the Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West*. Princeton University Press, 2013; M Irfan Riyadi, *Membangun Inklusivisme Faham Keagamaan* (Ponorogo: STAIN Press Ponorogo, 2009).

respectful to them even when shaking hands they kiss the hands of the Hindu teachers as children do to their parents.⁴⁰

In addition, according to Suardani (one of the Hindu teachers), the chief of Pesantren BBI never questioned the religious background, which indeed is different, of teachers. Moreover, the chief always visits pesantren's Hindu neighbors who died as a mourning expression and a form of good social relationship. For Suardani, "for him/her is his/her religion; for others is their religion". Religion is a matter of privacy.⁴¹ There is no compulsion in religion. Hence, a tolerant attitude should be developed in *pesantren*. If there is a recitation activity going on, non-Muslim teachers do not have to listen to it. To greet, non-Muslim teachers may say "good morning" or "good afternoon". The paradigm developed in managing the pesantren is a paradigm of mutual respect. Therefore, Muslim and Hindu teachers can live in harmony in the *pesantren*, regardless of their different religions. To some extent, some Hindu teachers are willing to continue to actively teach in the pesantren until retirement age.

The tolerant paradigm of Pesantren BBI is in line with its vision and mission. Its vision is "to become a *pesantren* as a base of knowledge, skill, and civilization to serve religion, nation and state", while the mission among others is: 1) to form an excellent, quality, virtuous, healthy-bodied, and knowledgeable human resources; 2) "to realize *Islam rahmatan lil 'alamin* in various activities of community services; 3) to be friendly with all people regardless of their different ethnic, geographical and ideological backgrounds; and 4) to prepare citizens to be characteristic Indonesian and devoted to the Almighty God.⁴² In addition, the paradigm of tolerance developed at the *pesantren* is motivated by political factors related to the situation and condition of the *pesantren* where the majority of society around is Hindu, and Muslims only live inside the area of the *pesantren* (minority). In order not to make Hindu people around resistant, the *pesantren*

⁴⁰ Fahmi, Nasir, and Hilmy, "Islamic Education in a Minority Setting, 345-364.

⁴¹ Interview with I Made Suardani, on October 25, 2018.

⁴² Profile of Pesantren Bali Bina Insani, 2018.

accommodate the existence of Hindu teachers. However, this is a political strategy undertaken by the *pesantren* in maintaining diversity and harmony in inter-religious (Hindu-Muslim) relationships.

This strategy is quite effective, as evidenced by the existence of *pesantren* that continue growing and developing. However, a few resistances from the Hindu community occasionally happened. For example, once the *pesantren* would build a 3rd floor building with the support from the Ministry of Public Works and Public Housing, but failed because the local village representatives who are Hindus suddenly stopped the construction. Moreover, they rallied community support to deny the construction. Because of that, the support from the Ministry was canceled. According to Jamal, actually, the 3rd-floor building construction project supported by the Ministry had started by installing several foundations. But suddenly some unscrupulous people stopped the construction process on the pretext of disturbing the preservation of the village. Finally, the construction was discontinued, and the project funds were returned to the Ministry.⁴³ The *pesantren* chose to succumb to long-term interests. If the *pesantren* had continued the construction frontally, there would have been a massive negative sentiment of the Hindu community, and possibly more refusing actions disrupting the *pesantren* existence. It is the long-term excess the *pesantren* tried to avoid when deciding the construction cancellation.

Covertly, the society around *pesantren* is still not willing the *pesantren* to develop. Hence, the *pesantren* develops tolerance and *tepo seliro* (respecting others) as a positive counter-reaction. Besides, the tolerant attitude itself is under the character of Islam. The tolerance paradigm is a thinking capital that leads to attitudes to preserving local wisdom, spreading inclusivity, and appreciating diversity (differences). It is important to be realized, especially in Indonesia which is not only multiethnic and multireligious but also multicultural. The plurality must be

⁴³ Interview with Jamal, on October 23, 2018.

managed by developing an attitude of tolerance toward anyone, including those at Pesantren BBI.⁴⁴

The inclusivity developed by Pesantren BBI is an initiative of its founders, considering the condition of the non-Muslim society around the pesantren. The pesantren's inclusivity one of which is indicated by recruiting Hindu teachers has also been admired by Azyumardi Azra when visiting this *pesantren*. He has even told the story about this *pesantren* when he became a speaker of a television show on the theme of the National Education System Act. Azra stated in the broadcast that the national curriculum should be as inclusive as practiced by Pesantren BBI.⁴⁵ Because of the inclusiveness of the *pesantren*, there arises a homegrown term of "ustadz or ustadzah Hindu", meaning Hindu teachers who teach the santri at schools located in the *pesantren* area, even though they teach general subjects. With the paradigm of inclusivity, people of the pesantren became accustomed to the differences. There is no gap between Muslims and Hindus in the pesantren. They, despite their different religions, can still live in harmony in the pesantren. Hindu teachers remain with their belief in the truth of their religion; Muslim teachers also remain with theirs. Everyone maintains the principle of his/her *aqidah* respectively; however, it does not prevent them to have harmonious and peaceful life at the *pesantren*.

The Management of Harmony

Pesantren BBI is managed to maintain the harmony of Muslims and Hindus in its area. It is interesting to be further detailed because it is in line with the practice of pluralism and multiculturalism. Concerning the issue, a tolerant attitude becomes very important. Tolerance is considered a new tightening instrument for restoring the nation's integration that for so long

⁴⁴ Fahmi, Nasir, and Hilmy, "Islamic Education in a Minority Setting, 345–364; Sarah Song, "Majority norms, multiculturalism, and gender equality." *American Political Science Review* 99.4 (2005): 473-489.

⁴⁵ Interview with Bahri, on October 23, 2018.

has torn apart.⁴⁶ It becomes a productive principle from the perspective of national integration of a great nation with various ethnicities, religions, customs, and social statuses. At Pesantren BBI, all human resources (both Hindu and Muslim) are openly involved in the planning stage. In the organizing stage, they are equally given tasks that suit their abilities. In actuating stage, they are required to perform their respective tasks professionally according to their job description. In the controlling stage, all human resources in the *pesantren* are monitored and evaluated transparently. These are the things that make Muslims and Hindus able to live in harmony and peace in the *pesantren*. All are treated the same regardless of a different religion.

The inclusive management of Pesantren BBI is inspired by the fact that people in this world are plural. Pluralism is a modern phenomenon that privileges individual freedom. Pluralism does not only highlight diversity but also questions the dominance of the majority, groups, or institutions in determining ethical values.⁴⁷ In this regard, pluralism does not conflict with the idea of unity and universalism which is based on rationalism and humanism. Pluralism is indeed intended to bring these values to a transnational and global level. This does not mean that pluralism ignores local and religious values. Pluralism turns out to get its legitimacy and acceptance from the justification of universal values in the local context.⁴⁸

Plurality is one of the objective facts of mankind that cannot be denied. It is one sort of *sunnatullah* (Allah's laws); only Allah knows and can explain on Judgement Day why human beings are made different from each other, and why their religions also

⁴⁶ Ali Maksum, "Discourses on Islam and democracy in Indonesia: A study on the intellectual debate between Liberal Islam Network (JIL) and Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI)." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 11.2 (2017): 405-422.

⁴⁷ Muhammad Khalid Masud, *The scope of pluralism in Islamic moral traditions from The Many and the One* (Princeton University Press, 2009), 180-192.

⁴⁸ Azyumardy Azra, "Cultural Pluralism In Indonesia: Continuous Reinventing of Indonesian Islam in Local, National and Global Contexts," *Asia-Pacific Journal on Religion and Society* 2, no. 2 (2019): 56-60; Harold Coward, *Pluralisme: Tantangan bagi Agama-agama*, terj. Bosco Carvallo (Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 1989).

vary.⁴⁹ In relation to that matter, Allah SWT once rebuked the Prophet Muhammad SAW when he showed a passionate desire to force people to accept and follow the teachings of Islam he was conveying.⁵⁰ According to Suardani, the existence of religious differences within the pesantren is a good thing, because it makes people learn how to care for and respect each other. Given these differences, the cultural aspect must be put forward; not the theological aspect.⁵¹ For example, Muslims in Bali learn Balinese culture dance, Balinese language, and the like. This enhances harmony in the social atmosphere with different religious communities in Pesantren BBI.

Hindu teachers at Pesantren BBI are also free to express their style and culture in dressing. There is no restriction concerning the way they dress. The *pesantren* do not oblige Hindu female teachers to wear hijab. They can leave their hair uncovered (without hijab). If there is a Hindu teacher wearing a *peci* (a type of cap usually worn by Indonesian Muslims) or a *hijab*, it happens on his/her own initiative, not under any compulsion from the pesantren. Relating to this, Bahri remarked:

“There is a Hindu male teacher who wears *peci*, a female who wears headscarves, such as Mrs. Wayan Sumartini once. When visiting here, Prof. Azyumardi Azra asked if there was a non-Muslim teacher. We answered yes; there were some. Then we introduced to him *Pak I Made Wayan, Bu Made Wayan Suwartini*, and He was surprised. Afterward, he asked them, “Why (are you) wearing a *peci*, (and why are you) wearing a headscarf?” They said that they just liked wearing it. When traveling together with us to Banyuwangi, they’re also wearing *peci* and veils. No one instructed them to do so. Yet, at that moment, those who are Muslims were not wearing *peci*.”⁵²

However, some Hindu female teachers do not wear *hijab*; they wear long-sleeve hem and trousers. Their hairs were left uncovered. This is like what Suardani (a Hindu vice principal for facilities and infrastructures of MTs Pesantren BBI) does. She

⁴⁹ Mohd Roslan Mohd Nor, Issa Khan, and Mohammad Elius. "Analysing the conceptual framework of religious freedom and interreligious relationship in Islam." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 8.2 (2018): 309-334.

⁵⁰ *ibid.*

⁵¹ Interview with Suardani, on October 25, 2018.

⁵² Interview with Bahri, on October 24, 2018.

enjoys feeling and does not feel isolated despite living in the middle of a muslimah community. Also, the Muslims in the *pesantren* never excluded Mrs. Made Suardani. A tolerant attitude and no compulsion over religion (including in the way to dress) at Pesantren BBI require politeness and courtesy in spreading religious teachings. Religious preaching to people, both who are in the same religion and who are not, should be done with the best approach and full of wisdom. Islamic teachings prohibit religious people from arguing about God with the believers of other scriptures because they also worship Allah Almighty in their own way.

Currently, education is still considered an important instrument in realizing the attitude of tolerance.⁵³ Education should be the path to spread tolerance, inclusivity, and mutual respect among people despite their different beliefs. Alex R. Rodger stated that "religious education is an integral part of education in general and serves to foster the understanding needed for people of different faiths, and strengthens the orthodoxy of their faith".⁵⁴ In other words, religious education is a means to explore the nature of religious beliefs in the educational process and specifically question the existence of a part of religious education in society. Religious education should be able to reflect the concept of pluralism, by transmitting values that can adequately foster tolerance, inclusivity, and freedom.⁵⁵ This is also what Sunan Kalijaga preaches by using terms that are "less

⁵³ Moh Abdul Kholiq Hasan, "Interfaith Tolerance and Its Relevance to the Indonesian Diversity: A Study on Ibn 'Āshūr's al-Taḥrīr Wa al-Tanwīr." *Ulumuna* 22.2 (2018): 333-362.

⁵⁴ Samah Ahmed Faried, "Measuring College Students' Perceptions to Tolerance Dimensions: Socio-Anthropological Study at Cairo." *International Journal of Psychological Studies* 10.2 (2018): 59-70.

⁵⁵ Syamsul Kurniawan, "Sukarno's Thought on the Importance of Reintegration of Religion and Science in Pesantren Education in Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 12.2 (2018): 219; Suprpto, "The theology of tolerance in Hindu and Islam: Maintaining social integration in Lombok-Indonesia." *Ulumuna* 19.2 (2015): 339-352; Ahmad Zamakhsari, "Teologi Agama-Agama Tipologi Tripolar; Eksklusivisme, Inklusivisme Dan Kajian Pluralisme." *Tsaqofah J. Agama dan Budaya* 18.1 (2020): 35-51.

Islamic", but are full of Islamic content in them. In simple language, religious education is esoteric not only exoteric.⁵⁶

A tolerant attitude is needed in the condition of plurality and diversity. So, it is necessary to develop pluralistic and tolerant Islamic teachings of education. This kind of thinking framework is directed towards a process of building pluralism-oriented awareness in terms of multireligious and multicultural conditions. In a wider framework, the structure of pluralistic Islamic teachings can be positioned as a part of comprehensive and systematic efforts to prevent and overcome ethnic-religious conflict, radicalism, and separatism, and to tighten national integration. The basic value of these teachings and practices is tolerance.

The Pesantren BBI and Proposed Organic Tolerance

In the Pesantren BBI, tolerance is put forward. It is preserved with mutual respect between one. Muslim teachers respect Hindu teachers, and Hindu teachers also do the same way. The attitude of mutual respect can be seen from the pattern of relationships that put something in the portion. The pattern of cooperative relationships can be seen clearly through the implementation of tasks under job description and specification. Despite their different religions, they come to each other when invited to social events. Pesantren BBI also promotes inclusive Islamic teachings. Islamic inclusivity is a religious notion based on the perspective that other religions on earth contain certain truths and can give benefits and salvation to their respective adherents.

The spirit of tolerance at Pesantren BBI is also perceived in managing *pesantren's* education curriculum. The variety of thought and *ijtihad* is taught to the *santri* without coercion. A tolerant attitude towards different ideas/opinions is applied. The virtue of tolerance education in this pesantren is reflected in curriculum content that abundantly teaches about the diversity of

⁵⁶ Waston, "Building peace through mystic philosophy: a study on the role of Sunan Kalijaga in Java." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 8.2 (2018): 281-308; C Ackerman, "What Is Self-Concept Theory? A Psychologist Explains," *Positive Psychology Studies*, 2018; Zakiyuddin Baidhawi, "Pendidikan Agama Berwawasan Multikultural: Sebuah Konsep Alternatif," *Jurnal Taswirul Afkar*, no. 16 (2004).

beliefs. In the field of religious studies are taught subject materials concerning comparative religion that widely covers histories, doctrines, phenomenon, and the dynamics of religion in the world. These materials are very substantial in the education of tolerance because students are given an understanding of the fundamental differences between their religious beliefs (Islam) with other religions. These also are very potential to build awareness of tolerance in the diversity of beliefs that will be encountered by the *santri* when living in society.

From the Hindu teacher side, Suardani for example feels there is no discrimination between Hindu and Muslim teachers so that they can live in harmony in the *pesantren*. Suardani stated:

“So far I have never felt isolated because of my different religion with the majority of management of the *pesantren*. I think religious issues are a personal matter; each religious adherent holds his respective belief. All are aiming at God, despite in different ways. In general, our religious beliefs (Hindu-Muslim) are the same, for example, God is the All-Seer, the All-Hearing, the All-Knowing, even to something very small like an atom. The point is the same to me. It's just different ways. We both wish to go into heaven in a variety of ways. It's something like if you want to go to Pesantren BBI, you can pass either Gilimanuk, or Tabanan City”.⁵⁷

Pesantren BBI has never questioned the religious beliefs of Hindu teachers as they have never highlighted their religious side and have never questioned the religious affairs of Muslim teachers. They respect each other despite their different religions. Those are the things that make the harmony among religious communities in the *pesantren* continue growing.

In terms of fostering religious attitudes and behaviors, *santris* are accustomed to mutually respecting fellow friends and especially teachers. The *pesantren*'s habituation method for *santris*, concerning religious and cultural diversity, is done by respecting their teachers despite their different religions. They shake and kiss the hands of teachers (Muslim or Hindu) as an expression of greeting. When the students learn social studies, the Balinese language, Balinese dance, and the like subjects with Hindu teachers, they stay *ta'zīm* (respectful) and consider the teacher's parents. Because some students are good at Balinese dance, they

⁵⁷ Interview with Suardani, on October 25, 2018.

have ever been invited by *Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama* (forum for religious harmony) to perform Balinese dance in her Bali-provincial-level meeting.⁵⁸

In this context, Ibn ‘Āshūr, as cited by Hasan, sees that tolerance is one crucial issue that religious followers are now facing. Grounded on the *maqāṣid* approach, he finds several principles of interreligious relation from the Quranic verses. These principles fit the highest objective of Islamic law (*maqāṣid al-sharī‘a*). These include drawing the common good and leaving away the damage, egalitarianism, justice, conscience, and freedom. These principles in the context of Indonesia are important and necessary to maintain harmony among religious people and the unity of the Republic of Indonesia.⁵⁹

Pesantren BBI is indeed inclusive; not exclusive. Although *kitab kuning* is taught in the pesantren, such as *Bulūgh al-Marām*, *Sullam al-Tawfiq*, *Ta’līm al-Muta’allim*, *Tafsīr Jalālayn*, etc., the teaching-learning processes are full of the nuances of pluralism, multiculturalism, and *tasāmuh* (tolerance). *Santris* who are taught by Hindu teachers is also not worried about being influenced by Hinduism, because they are always controlled by the *pesantren*. In addition, Hindu teachers are just focused on how to teach well, and they have no mission to preach their religion. The inclusivity and tolerance applied at Pesantren BBI have inspired its *santris* and the way to deal with differences.⁶⁰

The *santri*’s practice of tolerance is orientated to the tradition that currently exists and grows at the *pesantren*, for example, a message from the founder and the chief, H. Ketut Imaduddin Jamal and Yuli Saiful Bahri, who forbade the *santris* to be primordial. Another one is that *santris* should take off their songkok (a kind of cap commonly used in *pesantren*) when going out from the *pesantren*, to be well integrated with the society. In managing its institution, Pesantren BBI does not prioritize religious symbols, but that put the essence of Islamic teachings forward. If the *santris* can imitate and reproduce the founders' and

⁵⁸ Interview with Bahri, on October 24, 2018.

⁵⁹ Hasan, "Interfaith Tolerance, 333-362.

⁶⁰ Fahmi, Nasir, and Hilmy, "Islamic Education in a Minority Setting, 355.

chief's attitudes and thoughts, they will be broad-minded, moderate, inclusive, and tolerant human beings who are able to bring Islam as *rahmah li al-'ālamīn*; essentially a real *santris* who understand, implement and wisely respond to the values of diversity.

Conclusion

The tolerant attitude in the BBI Pesantren begins from a perspective that can accept the diversity and differences that exist. In Pesantren BBI, organic tolerance is packaged in the frame of multicultural education by adopting Hindu teachers and employees in formal schools (Madrasah Tsanawiyah and Madrasah Aliyah) under the auspices of the BBI. Organic tolerance in BBI pesantren is an inevitable practical reality and is present because of rational choices as a strategy for adapting boarding schools in a Muslim minority setting. This (organic) attitude and behavior is a key term in the findings of this study.

In addition, the capital of Pesantren BBI in harmonizing Muslim and Hindu teachers is tolerant (*tasāmuḥ*) and inclusive attitude. This is in line with the vision and mission of the *pesantren*. The management of harmony at the *pesantren* is implemented professionally. The *pesantren* does not emphasize religious symbols, but the essence of Islamic teachings instead. The *pesantren* never questions primordial traits such as ethnic and religious differences as long as people of different religious backgrounds (Muslims and Hindus) can get along within the *pesantren*. For them, it is important to perform their duties properly and professionally following the mandate given to them.

References

- Ackerman, C. "What Is Self-Concept Theory? A Psychologist Explains." *Positive Psychology Studies*, 2018.
- Asrori, Achmad. "Contemporary religious education model on the challenge of Indonesian multiculturalism." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 10, no. 2 (2016).
- Azra, Azyumardi. "Cultural Pluralism In Indonesia: Continuous Reinventing of Indonesian Islam in Local, National and Global

- Contexts." *Asia-Pacific Journal on Religion and Society* 2, no. 2 (2019).
- Almirzana, Syafa'atun. "Pluralisme, Konflik, Dan Dialog: Analisa Dan Refleksi." *Jurnal Esensia* 2, no. 1 (2001).
- Baidhawi, Zakiyuddin. "Pendidikan Agama Berwawasan Multikultural: Sebuah Konsep Alternatif." *Jurnal Taswirul Afkar* 16 (2004).
- Basyar, M. Hamdan. *Minoritas Muslim Bali: Di Gianyar dan Tabanan*. Vol. 2. Jakarta: Kerjasama Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia dan Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional RI, 2009.
- Coward, Harold. *Pluralisme: Tantangan bagi Agama-agama*, terj. Bosco Carvallo. Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 1989.
- Crawford, Beverly, and Ronnie D. Lipschutz. "The myth of" ethnic conflict": politics, economics, and" cultural" violence." *Research Series* (1998).
- Dangubić, M., Maykel Verkuyten, and Tobias H. Stark. "Understanding (in) tolerance of Muslim minority practices: A latent profile analysis." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 47, no. 7 (2021).
- Darling-Hammond, Linda, et al. "Implications for the educational practice of the science of learning and development." *Applied developmental science* 24, no. 2 (2020).
- Engineer, Asghar Ali. "On Religious and Intercultural Dialogue." [Http://Www. Global. Net. Com](http://www.global.net.com), 2000.
- Fahmi, Muhammad, M Ridlwan Nasir, and Masdar Hilmy. "Islamic Education in a Minority Setting." *Epistemé: Jurnal Pengembangan Ilmu Keislaman* 15, no. 2 (2020).
- Fahmi, Muhammad. *Pendidikan multikultural sebagai strategi adaptasi Pesantren Bali Bina Insani di daerah minoritas muslim Tabanan Bali*. Dissertation, UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2019.
- Fanani, Abd Chayyi. "Studi tentang Metode Belajar Mahasiswa Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Upaya Pengembangan Diri di Fakultas Tarbiyah IAIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya Periode 2000-2002." *Jurnal Fakultas Tarbiyah Uin Sunan Ampel Surabaya* (2003).
- Faried, Samah Ahmed. "Measuring College Students' Perceptions to Tolerance Dimensions: Socio-Anthropological Study at

- Cairo." *International Journal of Psychological Studies* 10, no. 2 (2018).
- Haddad, Yvonne Yazbeck, and Jane I. Smith, eds. *Muslim minorities in the West: Visible and invisible*. Rowman Altamira, 2002.
- Hanafi, Hasan. *Islam in The Modern World: Tradition, Revolution and Culture* Vol. II. Kairo: Dar Keba Bookshop, 2000.
- Hasan, Moh Abdul Kholiq. "Interfaith Tolerance and Its Relevance to the Indonesian Diversity: A Study on Ibn 'Āshūr's al-Tahrīr Wa al-Tanwīr," *Ulumuna* 22, no. 2 (2018).
- Helbling, Marc. "Islamophobia in the West: An introduction." *Islamophobia in the West*. Routledge, 2013.
- Helbling, Marc. "Opposing Muslims and the Muslim headscarf in Western Europe." *European sociological review* 30, no. 2 (2014).
- Hidayat, Komarudin. "Agama-Agama Besar Dunia: Masalah Perkembangan Dan Interelasi" Dalam Komarudin Hidayat Dan Ahmad Gaus AF." *Passing Over Melintasi Batas Agama*. Jakarta: Gramedia, 1999, 1998.
- Jennifer Brady, "An Interview With Paul Gorski, Creator Of The Multicultural Pavilion", in laulima.hawaii.edu, accessed 7th August 2022.
- Kuntowijoyo. *Paradigma Islam: Interpretasi Untuk Aksi*, edited by A.E Priyono. Bandung: Mizan Publika, 2008.
- Kurniawan, Syamsul. "Sukarno's Thought on the Importance of Reintegration of Religion and Science in Pesantren Education in Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 12, no. 2 (2018).
- Mahjuddin, Akhiruddin. *Dampak Konflik terhadap Perkembangan Ekonomi dan Tingkat Kesejahteraan Rakyat*. Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia, 2012.
- Maksum, Ali. "Discourses on Islam and democracy in Indonesia: A study on the intellectual debate between Liberal Islam Network (JIL) and Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI)." *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 11, no. 2 (2017).
- Maksum, Ali. *Pluralisme dan multikulturalisme: paradigma baru pendidikan agama Islam di Indonesia*. Malang: Aditya Media Publication, 2011.

- Manstead, Antony SR. "The psychology of social class: How socioeconomic status impacts thought, feelings, and behavior." *British Journal of Social Psychology* 57, no. 2 (2018).
- Mashad, Dhurorudin. *Muslim Bali: mencari kembali harmoni yang hilang*. Jakarta: Pustaka Al Kautsar, 2014.
- Maskur, Ahmad. "Masalah Kebangsaan Halaman 1 - Kompasiana.Com." Accessed October 17, 2022. <https://www.kompasiana.com/ahmadmaskur2/5529b61ff17e612416d624a5/masalah-kebangsaan>.
- Masud, Muhammad Khalid. *The scope of pluralism in Islamic moral traditions from The Many and the One*. Princeton University Press, 2009.
- Naim, Ngainun, and Achmad Sauqi. *Pendidikan Multikultural: Konsep Dan Aplikasi*. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media, 2008.
- Nor, Mohd Roslan Mohd, Issa Khan, and Mohammad Elius. "Analysing the conceptual framework of religious freedom and interreligious relationship in Islam." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 8, no. 2 (2018).
- Pesantren Bali Bina Insani. "Profile Pesantren Bali Bina Insani." Accessed September 23, 2020. <https://pesantrenbali.com/profil-pondok-pesantren-bali-bina-insani-yayasan-la-royba/>.
- Prasetya, Senata Adi, et al. "Epistemic Rationality In Islamic Education: The Significance for Religious Moderation in Contemporary Indonesian Islam." *Ulul Albab* 22, no. 2 (2021).
- Prasetya, Senata Adi. *Epistemologi rasional dalam pendidikan Islam: studi komparasi pemikiran Muhammad Abid al Jabiri dan Mohammed Arkoun*. Masterh thesis, UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2022.
- Priyono, AE. *Paradigma Islam: Interpretasi Untuk Aksi*. Bandung: Mizan Publika, 2008.
- Qomaruzzaman, Bambang, and B Busro. "Tolerance Islam Theology of Education Hermeneutic Reading of Tariq Ramadan Thought." *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)* 7, no. 2 (2019).
- Riyadi, M Irfan. *Membangun Inklusivisme Faham Keagamaan*. Ponorogo: STAIN Press Ponorogo, 2009.

- Salatalohy, Fahmi, and Rio Pelu, eds. *Nasionalisme kaum pinggiran: dari Maluku tentang Maluku untuk Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: LKiS Pelangi Aksara, 2004.
- Saroglou, Vassilis, et al. "Host society's dislike of the Islamic veil: The role of subtle prejudice, values, and religion." *International journal of intercultural relations* 33, no. 5 (2009).
- Shihab, Alwi. *Islam Inklusif: Menuju Sikap Terbuka Dalam Beragama*. Diterbitkan atas kerja sama AN Teve dan Penerbit Mizan, 1997.
- Sniderman, Paul M., and Louk Hagendoorn. "When ways of life collide." *When Ways of Life Collide*. Princeton University Press, 2009.
- Song, Sarah. "Majority norms, multiculturalism, and gender equality." *American Political Science Review* 99, no. 4 (2005).
- Suprpto. "The theology of tolerance in Hindu and Islam: Maintaining social integration in Lombok-Indonesia." *Ulumuna* 19, no. 2 (2015).
- Van der Noll, Jolanda. "Religious toleration of Muslims in the German public sphere." *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 38 (2014).
- Veegar, K. J. *Realitas Sosial: refleksi filsafat sosial atas hubungan individu-masyarakat dalam cakrawala sejarah sosiologi*. Jakarta: Gramedia, 1986.
- Waston, Waston. "Building peace through mystic philosophy: a study on the role of Sunan Kalijaga in Java." *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 8, no. 2 (2018): 281-308.
- Wendy Amosa, and Paul C. Gorski, "Directions and misdirections in multicultural education: An analysis of session offerings at the annual conference of the National Association for Multicultural Education." *Multicultural Perspectives* 10, no. 3 (2008).
- Zagorin, Perez. "How the idea of religious toleration came to the West." *How the Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West*. Princeton University Press, 2013.
- Zamakhari, Ahmad. "Teologi Agama-Agama Tipologi Tripolar; Eksklusivisme, Inklusivisme Dan Kajian Pluralisme." *Tsaqofah J. Agama dan Budaya* 18, no. 1 (2020).